

Racing Rules Committee Minutes



The Racing Rules Committee met at 09:30 – 18:00 hours at the Bandar Hotel, Muscat, Sultanate of Oman on Wednesday 13 November 2013

1. Opening of the Meeting	1	9. Racing Rules Committee Representatives on other Committees	7
2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting	1	10. Prescriptions	7
3. Other Submissions	2	11. Special Working Parties	7
4. The Racing Rules of Sailing	2	12. Annual Report	8
5. The Case Book	4	13. Discussion	8
6. The Call Book for Match Racing & Team Racing 2013	6	14. ISAF Special Events	8
7. ISAF Racing Rules Question & Answer Service	7	15. Any other Business	8
8. 2016 Olympic Sailing Competition	7		

Present:

Bernard Bonneau - Chairman	Bill O'Hara
John Doerr – Vice Chairman	Andrus Poksi
Neven Baran	Qu Chun
Lance Burger	Dick Rose
Jim Capron	Ana Sánchez del Campo Ferrer
Kamen Fillyov	Katsumi Shibnuma
Ulrich Finckh	Richard Slater
Luciano Giacomi	Zofia Truchanowicz
Ricardo Lobato	
Ricardo Navarro (Race Officials Representative – Non-Voting)	

Apologies

Shane Borrell
Marianne Middelthon
Rick Hatch
Leo Pieter Stoel
Richard Thompson
Gary Jobson – Vice President

1. Opening of the Meeting

The Chairman opened the meeting and welcomed the new Committee to Oman and to the new rules cycle.

2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

(a) Minutes

The Committee noted the minutes of the Racing Rules Committee meeting of Tuesday 6 November 2012 (circulated and approved after the meeting). The minutes can be downloaded at www.sailing.org/meetings

(b) Minutes Matters Arising

There were no other matters arising.

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

3. Other Submissions

- (a) Submission 031-13

The Committee considered submission 031-13 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee, Race Officials Committee and Racing Rules Committee about Joint Rule 69 Working Party – Regulation 5.5.1(c)

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (b) Submission 034-13

The Committee considered submission 034-13 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee about ISAF Regulations - Regulation 11, Removal of ISAF Codes Regulations, New Regulation 38.

Submission withdrawn

4. The Racing Rules of Sailing

The Committee considered the following submissions and made recommendation to Council:

- (a) Submission 104-13 - Definition Clear Astern and Clear Ahead; Overlap

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment

~~“The terms~~ **They** apply to boats on opposite tacks only when rule 18 applies between them or when both boats are sailing more than ninety degrees from the true wind.”

- (b) Submission 105-13 - Definition Proper Course:

Recommendation to Council: Reject

The concept is already included in the definition.

- (c) Submission 106 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rationalisation of Sound Signal Requirements – Rules 26 and 29.1

Recommendation to Council: Reject

A sound signal will not be heard at the same time by all competitors. Also, the sound signal required with flag X would be made before the display of flag X and, therefore, would not be used to draw attention to the flag.

- (d) Submission 107-13 – Rule 61.1(a)(3)

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment

Delete “that boat” and replace it with “the other boat” and subject to editing by the RRC Working Party.

Recommendation to Council: Reject

The concept is already included in the definition.

- (e) Submission 108-13 – Rule 62.2 and 66

Submission withdrawn

- (f) Submission 109-13 – Rule 63.3.3(a)

Recommendation to Council: Reject

This would be a major undesirable change to the rules.

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- (g) Submission 110-13 - Use of ISAF in Various Rules
Recommendation to Council: Approve
- (h) Submission 111-13 – Rule 86.1(b)
Recommendation to Council: Approve
Vote: 12 in favour, 4 against, 1 abstain
- (i) Submission 112-13 Rule B3.31
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
The word “mark” to be in italics.
The Committee approved an urgent rule change with effect from 1 January 2014 under ISAF Regulation 28.1.2 by unanimous vote
- (j) Submission 113-13 - Rule F2 18, Appendix F Definitions “Mark-Room”, “Zone” and “About to Round or Pass”
Recommendation to Council: Reject
RRC supports the testing of new rules under rules 86.2 or 86.3
- (k) Submission 114-13 – Rule F13
Recommendation to Council: Reject
RRC supports the testing of new rules under rules 86.2 or 86.3
- (l) Submission 115-13 - Composition of International Juries - Appendix N
Recommendation to Council: Reject
The change is unnecessary
- (m) Submission 116-13 – Rule N1
Recommendation to Council: Defer
The criteria mentioned in the first line of the proposal are missing, so the proposal is difficult to evaluate. Defer for further work by a working party appointed by ROC with representatives also from ICC and RRC.
- (n) Submission 117-13 - Size and Composition of International Juries - Appendix N1.2
Recommendation to Council: Reject
RRC prefers the approach in Submission 116-13

5. The Case Book

- (a) The Committee received a progress report from the Case Book Working Party made by Dick Rose.
- (b) The Committee considered the following submissions and made recommendations to Council. .
- (c) Submission 118-13 – New Case (Appeal 107)

Recommendation to Council: Reject

RRC agrees with the principle, but all levels of racing needs to be considered.

- (d) Submission 119-13 - New Case (Question 110)

Recommendation to Council: Reject

- (e) Submission 120-13 - New Case based on Q&A B002

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment

Vote: 16 in favour, 1 against, 0 abstain

Assumed Facts for Question 1

In a fleet race with 10 knots wind, two one-design dinghies, each 5 metres in length, are approaching each other on close-hauled courses. S is on starboard tack and P is on port tack. P does not change course or speed. S also holds her course and speed. There is contact between S's bow and P's starboard quarter, about 20 centimetres from P's stern, causing damage. Neither boat takes a penalty. S protests P.

Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party.

- (f) Submission 121-13 - New Case based on Q&A B003

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment

Change Answer to read as follows:

At any point in time, the right-of-way boat at that moment is entitled by rule 19.2(a) to choose on which side she will pass the obstruction. Therefore, while AW is clear ahead of BL, she has the right to choose to pass the obstruction on either side. ~~However, a~~After the boats become overlapped, AW has lost that right, and at that time BL has the right to choose.

*When a right-of-way boat acts to implement a choice she has made under rule 19.2(a), she must comply with any applicable rules of Sections A and B. In addition, rule 19.2(b) applies if the boats are overlapped. In that case, the outside boat must give the inside boat room between her and the obstruction, unless she has been unable to do so from the time the overlap began. **Finally, rule 21 applies while the inside boat is taking the room to which she is entitled under rule 19.2(b).***

Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party.

- (g) Submission 122-13 - New Case based on Q&A B004

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment

Amend the fourth line of the second paragraph of the Answer from: "had she given PM and PL enough space" to "had she given PM and PW enough space".

Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- (h) Submission 123-13 – New Case based on Q&A D001
Recommendation to Council: Approve
Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party
- (i) Submission 124-13 - New Case based on Q&A E001
Recommendation to Council: Approve
Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party
- (j) Submission 125-13 - New Case based on Q&A E002
Recommendation to Council: Approve
Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party
- (k) Submission 126-13 - New Case based on Q&A E003
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
1. The second paragraph of the Assumed Facts for Question 1 to read:
“The committee sets the finishing line for the shortened course as shown in the diagram. At the time that flag S was displayed, the boats were between the last rounding mark and the finishing line. Boats A and B approach the finishing line, see flag S and sail the courses shown in the diagram.”
2. In Answer 2 change “No.” to “No, but this action was not good race management practice.”
3. Delete the last two paragraphs of Answer 2.
Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party.
- (l) Submission 127-13 - New Case based on Q&A J003
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
The case is to become two separate cases, the first of which to contain Q&A 1 and Q&A 2, and the second to contain Q&A 3.
Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party.
- (m) Submission 128-13 - New Case based on Q&A M001
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
Vote: 13 in favour, 1 against, 3 abstain
In abstract and in the second line of the Answer, insert “all” before “other boats”.
At the beginning of the third paragraph of the Answer, delete “Similarly” and replace it with “Also”.
Subject to editing by the Case Book Working Party.
- (n) Submission 129-13 – New Case based on Q&A M002
Submission withdrawn.

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

6. The Call Book for Match Racing & Team Racing

- (a) The Committee received a progress report from the Match and Team Racing Working Party made by Marianne Middelthon
- (b) The Committee considered the following submissions and made recommendations to Council.
- (c) Submission 130-13 –New MR Call C3
Submission withdrawn
- (d) Submission 131-13 - Additional Question in New MR Call C3
Submission withdrawn
- (e) Submission 132-13 – MR Call E3
Recommendation to Council: Approve
Vote: 14 in favour, 1 against, 2 abstain
Subject to editing by the Match & Team Racing Rules Working Party
- (f) Submission 133-13-New MR Call L3
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
 1. Change to title to ‘MR CALL L9’.
 2. In the italicized sentence above Question 1, change “but nevertheless” to “but may be unaware that she was OCS and nevertheless”.
 3. In the last line of Answer 1, change “then” to “than”.
 4. Delete from Answer 3 “they are on the same lap and”.
 5. In the second Reason, change “she is sailing” to “she is not sailing”.*Subject to editing by the Match & Team Racing Rules Working Party*
- (g) Submission 134-13 - - New Team Racing Call D9
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
The proposed Q&A is to become Q&A 2 in TR Call D2.
Subject to editing by the Match & Team Racing Rules Working Party
- (h) Submission 135-13 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Team Racing Call L7
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
In Answer 3, change “progress” to “process”.
Subject to editing by the Match & Team Racing Rules Working Party
- (i) Submission 136-13 – New Team Racing Call M10
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
Amend Answer (a) to read “hail for room to tack” in first sentence.
Subject to editing by the Match & Team Racing Rules Working Party

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

7. ISAF Racing Rules Question & Answer Service

The Committee received a report from the Chairman of the Racing Rules Q&A Panel Ana Sanchez about the ISAF Racing Rules Question and Answer Service in 2013.

8. 2016 Olympic Sailing Competition

- (a) The Committee received reports from the Chairman of the Racing Rules Committee and the ISAF Head of Competitions Alastair Fox.

9. Racing Rules Committee Representatives on other Committees

- (a) Equipment Committee

The Committee received a verbal report from the Equipment Committee representative Dick Rose.

- (b) Equipment Control Sub-committee

The Committee receive a verbal report from the Equipment Control Sub-committee representative Dick Rose.

- (c) Class Rule Sub-committee

The Committee received a verbal report from the Class Rule Sub-committee representative Jim Capron.

- (d) Race Officials Committee

The Committee receive a verbal report from the Race Officials Committee representative John Doerr.

10. Prescriptions

The Committee received a progress report from the Chairman on the National Authority Prescriptions web page on the ISAF website

Decision

The Chairman, ISAF Secretariat and Executive Committee should liaise in advance of the next rules cycle in order to clarify the arrangements for the approval of national authority prescriptions.

11. Special Working Parties

- (a) The Committee received a progress report from the Addendum Q Working party made by Jan Stage.
- (b) The Committee received a progress report from the Boards (Windsurfing and Kite) Rules Group made by Andrus Poksi.
- (c) The Committee received a progress report from the Appendices J, K, L, LE Group made by Jim Capron.
- (d) The Committee received a progress report from Special Rules Panel made by Bernard Bonneau.
- (e) The Committee received a progress report from Rule 69 and Judicial Matter Group made by John Doerr.

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- (f) The Committee received a progress report from Rule 42 Group made by Zofia Truchanowicz.

Decision

The Committee recommends the Rule 42 Working Party considers whether the word “clearly” needs to be defined in the interpretations.

12. Annual Report

The Committee noted the Chairman’s report to the ISAF Council meeting of 15 November 2013 on the activities of the Racing Rules Committee for the period 1 January to date.

13. Discussion

- (a) The Committee received a presentation on the America’s Cup rules by Richard Slater and John Doerr.
- (b) The Chairman of the Case Book Working Party presented four problem cases (Cases 10 and 54 from 2009-2012 Case Book withdrawn for revision, and cases based on Q&A M 003 2013-012 and Q&A B 001 2013-01). The CBWP was divided and unable to agree on a proposal and request the RRC to give advice on. Decision: matter to be sent to RRC members for written answer within one month.

14. ISAF Special Events

The Committee received a verbal report from the ISAF Competitions Manager.

15. Any other Business

There were no further business, the meeting was closed.